

Written response by the Welsh Government to the Culture, Welsh Language and Communications Committee report on the Welsh Government Draft Budget 2019-20. The Committee met on 08/11/2018 and 14/11/2018 to discuss these matters.

We would like to thank the Committee for their time and for their comments in the report sent on 27 November 2018. Our responses to the individual recommendations are set out below.

Detailed Responses to the report's recommendations are set out below:

Recommendation 1 (paragraph 11)

The Committee was unclear of the extent to which the Welsh Government is evaluating changes in ways of working following the inclusion of the instruction on delivering the wellbeing goals in the relevant remit letters. The Committee would like to see the Welsh Government provide further information to the Committee on this point

Response: Accept.

Progress against the priorities set out in the Remit Letters is monitored by means of reviewing the quarterly performance reports which sponsored bodies submit to the sponsor teams in the Welsh Government, including discussion at the Quarterly Monitoring meetings. The principles set out in the Well-being of Future Generations Act have always been central to the way in which these bodies work. Culture is about preserving our past for the benefit of future generations, and promoting and encouraging participation. Discussions with the bodies at these meetings cover the ways in which the bodies preserve their properties and collections, collaborate with each other and with other organisations, and enable access and involve people in their work.

The precise ways in which the bodies demonstrate how they comply with the requirements of the Act varies. For example, each of Arts Council for Wales' target areas detailed in the annual Operation Plan now include a specific checklist against the seven well-being goals. The National Museums' well-being statement, *Inspiring People, Changing Lives*, provides a clear view of how they will meet the well-being goals through their work, and how the five ways of working will be employed to do so; and the National Library identifies how it will contribute within its strategy for 2017-2021: *The Nation's Memory: Informing the Future*.

Recommendation 2 (paragraph 14)

The Committee was concerned that the capital investment by the Minister's Department should be shared across Wales. The Minister agreed to provide a note on the geographical spread of capital funding for Culture and the Arts.

Response: Accept.

Capital funding across the portfolio is geographically spread focusing on projects which will deliver benefits not just locally but for wider benefits for the people of Wales.

Capital funding for the Arts is in general provided by the Arts Council for Wales as the lottery distributor. In addition, the Welsh Government has provided capital investment for major projects, most notably in recent years the Glyn Vivian Museum in Swansea and the Pontio Centre in Bangor.

Capital funding for the National Museums is also provided for major projects. The redevelopment of St. Fagan's is now complete. We are in discussions with the National Museums about proposed developments at the National Slate Museum in Llanberis, and at the Roman Legion Museum in Caerleon.

There is also a Capital Transformation Grant scheme, which is open to all public libraries and accredited local museums and archives. A total of £1.38m per year is available to support service improvements. It is a competitive process and the fund is heavily over-subscribed each year. Over the past two financial years, funding has been awarded to projects in 14 separate local authority areas across the breadth of Wales.

Recommendation 3 (paragraph 19)

The Committee would like to see greater clarity from the Welsh Government on the extent to which grants will be available to owners of listed buildings and scheduled monuments, and what steps have been taken to communicate this policy to them

Response: Accept.

The focus of Cadw's grants for historic building repair schemes is on helping to save listed buildings which are at risk and/or stimulate regeneration opportunities and deliver benefits to Welsh communities. One of the ways in which these benefits can be provided is through skills development and access opportunities. Any investment is based on a partnership approach, with Cadw funding up to 50% of grant eligible works. We seek assurances on other available sources of funding through our application process and encourage innovative solutions and collaboration. Our eligibility criteria and requirements are set out on our website and this will be updated with information on the next round of funding shortly.

Recommendation 4 (paragraph 24)

The Committee would like to be updated on the outcome of this research. The Committee would also like additional information on where responsibility for £100,000 fund lies, how it is being promoted, what are the expected outcomes from the spending and how these will be evaluated.

Response: Accept in principle.

The Welsh Government has committed to providing £100k in 2018-19 and £100k in 2019-20 to support journalists seeking to set up their own business in hyper-local news. This is additional to the existing support for businesses through Business Wales. This funding is within the portfolio of the Minister for Economy and Transport, and any further questions should be directed to the Minister.

Recommendation 5 (paragraph 26)

The Committee understands the current constraints on funding, however the Committee is concerned that the cash flat budget may not allow sufficient progress toward the Welsh Government’s ambitious target of 1 million Welsh speakers by 2050.

Response: Accept.

We accept that the target of reaching 1 million Welsh speakers is ambitious.

However, the additional £6.5 million revenue in 2019-20 (which forms part of the two year Budget agreement with Plaid Cymru) and the capital funding for the Welsh in Education Strategic Plans (WESPs) and the Childcare Offer has given us the opportunity to lay the foundations in supporting the Work Programme between now and 2021. We have been able to focus on prioritising the work of developing provision in the following areas: child care, post-16 and in the workplace.

Whilst the majority of funding comes from three BELS (Welsh Language, Welsh in Education, Welsh Language Commissioner), additional resources from other funding streams also support the implementation of the strategy. These additional resources include activities funded through the Education MEG and include the evaluation of projects undertaken by the WLD (which relate to statutory education), financial support offered for the Welsh language sabbatical scheme and projects in support of Welsh medium Initial Teacher Training provision. As the Welsh language is a cross Government priority, all policy areas have to consider how they support the aims of *Cymraeg 2050*.

We will continue to review progress against the targets and our budgets carefully and will refine accordingly.

Recommendation 6 (paragraph 32)

(i) The Welsh Government has agreed to provide further details on the expected outcomes of the Sabbatical Scheme to the Committee including the numbers of participants on the short courses, the “Welsh in a Year” course and the evaluation of the language abilities of participants once they return to their schools.

Response: Accept.

The purpose of the Welsh language Sabbatical Scheme (WLSS) is twofold:

- to develop the Welsh language skills of practitioners in the English-medium sector to enable them to deliver Welsh as part of the Curriculum.
- to up skill practitioners in bilingual and Welsh-medium schools to enable them to teach more subjects through the medium of Welsh or to improve their language skills in order to develop the Welsh literacy skills of learners across the curriculum.

Courses are provided on three levels. The objectives and details of the courses are described below:

Course	Target Audience	Duration	Objectives
Entry – Mynediad	TAs from English- medium primaries	5 weeks	<p>The aim of the course is to provide participants with the vocabulary and language patterns they need to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • help their teacher colleagues to deliver the Developing Welsh AoLE in the Foundation Phase. • help their teacher colleagues to teach Welsh in Key Stage 2. • introduce Welsh into all aspects of school life whenever the opportunity arises, whether in the classroom, on the yard or during extracurricular activities.
Foundation – Sylfaen	Teachers from English- medium primaries	11 weeks	<p>The aim of the course is to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • teach the grammar and vocabulary of the language to practitioners. • develop practitioners' confidence in using Welsh in a wider range of contexts in school. • give practitioners the language resources and confidence to deliver Welsh as a second language to learners up to at least level 5 of the National Curriculum. • equip practitioners to deliver some lessons or parts of lessons on other curriculum subjects through the medium of Welsh. • instil accuracy so that teachers are good language models for learners. • share good practice with regard to teaching Welsh as a second language. • develop the teachers' knowledge of the methodology of second language teaching. • expand knowledge of suitable resources and of other recent

			<p>developments in teaching Welsh and developing progressive subject leaders.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • produce confident Welsh speakers.
Advanced – Uwch	Teachers and TAs from Welsh-medium and bilingual schools	20 days (over 1 academic term)	<p>The Advanced courses are aimed at practitioners who already speak Welsh and who wish to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • extend their language skills in a professional context, both orally and on paper. • reinforce and develop their personal language skills in teaching, conducting assessments and carrying out various administrative tasks. • develop their knowledge of Welsh medium and bilingual teaching methodology. • have confidence they can discuss the terminology of their subject effectively and correctly. • be confident in checking pupils' work.
Welsh in a Year	Teachers from English-medium primaries	1 academic year	<p>The aim of the course is to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • teach the grammar and vocabulary of the language to practitioners. • develop practitioners' confidence in planning the use of Welsh across the curriculum in line with consortium / local authority strategic requirements. • provide practitioners with the language resources and the confidence to deliver Welsh to pupils. • prepare practitioners to deliver lessons or parts of cross-curricular lessons through the medium of Welsh. • foster accuracy so that teachers provide pupils with a good language model. • share good practice in teaching Welsh. • discuss the methodology of teaching Welsh as a second language. • develop, prepare and share appropriate resources and to foster innovative subject leaders. • produce confident Welsh speakers.

The current contracts started in September 2013 and will end in July 2020. Contracts were awarded through a procurement exercise, and the successful providers were

Cardiff University, Bangor University and University of Wales Trinity Saint David. The number of participants on the various courses at the three locations since the start of the current contracts can be found in the table below:

	Entry	Foundation	Advanced	Welsh in a Year	Total
2013/14					
Bangor University	9	11	39		59
University of Wales Trinity St David	36	30	13		79
Cardiff University	34	29	21		84
2014/15					
Bangor University	0	7	8		15
University of Wales Trinity St David	29	38	26		93
Cardiff University	42	28	11		81
2015/16					
Bangor University	12	14	29		55
University of Wales Trinity St David	42	38	23		103
Cardiff University	39	25	23		87
2016/17					
Bangor University	12	14	22		48
University of Wales Trinity St David	25	34	48		107
Cardiff University	43	27	40		110
2017/18					
Bangor University	10	10	20	11	51
University of Wales Trinity St David	39	33	49	14	135
Cardiff University	42	28	22	11	103
2018/19					
Bangor University	28	14	28	13	55
University of Wales Trinity St David	28	14	28	27	97*
Cardiff University	28	0	14	26	68

*UW TSD will also pilot a course on intermediate level in the summer term with an expected attendance of 14 teachers.

An evaluation of the Sabbatical Scheme has been commissioned, with work expected to commence in January 2019. The evaluation has two aims. The first is to examine how, and to what extent, the Sabbatical Scheme contributes to change in the way that Welsh is taught or used as a medium of teaching in schools. The second aim is to assess the contribution of the Sabbatical Scheme to professional development provision for practitioners to develop their Welsh language skills or to teach through the medium of Welsh. The evaluation findings will provide the basis for the strategic development of the Sabbatical Scheme and practitioner training in future.

(ii) The Committee believes that the Welsh Government's targets for increasing Welsh-medium early years education provision should be sufficiently ambitious to meet the overall strategy for reaching a million Welsh speakers by 2050. The Committee will continue to monitor the delivery of Welsh-medium nursery settings against the interim targets set by the Minister to deliver the total of 150 settings by 2050.

Response: Accept.

Cymraeg 2050 refers to the importance of the early years, so it is vital to ensure that the strategy's targets in this area set firm foundations to build on.

Targets have been set to establish:

- 40 new Welsh medium nursery groups by 2021 (*Cymraeg 2050 – Work Programme 2017-21*).
- 150 new Welsh medium nursery groups by 2027 (*Cymraeg 2050 – A Million Welsh Speakers*).

Whilst the targets in *Cymraeg 2050* are on the basis of numbers of additional nursery groups, there is significant variation in the size of childcare settings. Officials have therefore been working with Mudiad Meithrin to gain a clearer understanding of numbers of children attending Cylchoedd Meithrin. We will monitor the progress against the number of settings as well as children attending settings to ensure the childcare sector provides a sound footing to realise the other aspects of the trajectory set out in *Cymraeg 2050*.

A number of factors will influence the precise journey towards one million Welsh speakers. Therefore we will continuously review progress against all of the strategy's targets and revisit the trajectory as necessary.

Recommendation 7 (paragraph 34)

The Committee questioned if this additional funding would be sufficient to deliver the action plan priorities given that the action plan has not yet been published. The Committee has requested further details on the priorities in the action plan, and the funding supporting them, when this information is available.

Response: Accept.

On 11 December, Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol published its Further Education and Apprenticeship Welsh-medium Action Plan.

The plan sets out short, medium and long term actions, with the following priorities:

- Ensure learners are provided with support and information to progress along the Welsh language continuum in post-16 education and training and onto post-19 where appropriate.
- Create an improved infrastructure to enable learners to increase the level of learning undertaken through the medium of Welsh.
- Build and extend existing staff development opportunities to enable post-16 education and training providers to increase the level of Welsh-medium provision.
- Engage effectively with employers to enable effective skills planning to take place.

In 2018-19, £150,000 was allocated to enable Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol to start working in areas where early influence was possible to improve and create infrastructure that could be developed further in future. For 2019-20, Coleg Cymraeg Cenedlaethol will introduce Action Plan based priorities to be agreed with the Welsh Government, and £150,000 will be available to this end. In addition to this specific budget, other budgets within the Welsh Language Division will support the Welsh medium post-16 sector.

Recommendation 8 (paragraph 37)

(i) The Committee would like a firmer undertaking from the Welsh Government that it is their intention to underwrite any costs from tribunal activities by the Welsh Language Commissioner's office which cannot be met from its funding reserves.

Response: Accept.

The Minister with responsibility for the Welsh Language meets with the Welsh Language Commissioner quarterly, and officials meet on a regular basis. Any financial pressures would be raised at those meetings. If funding legal proceedings associated with implementing the Measure would lead to financial pressures, the Welsh Ministers would have to consider whether additional funding would need to be allocated to the Commissioner.

(ii) The Committee were keen to understand the process by which the budget proposals were agreed between the Minister for Welsh Language and Lifelong Learning and the Welsh Language Commissioner. The Committee will be asking the Welsh Government to set out the communication between the Minister, officials and the Welsh Language Commissioner. In particular, the

Committee would like to understand the timing and nature of the Commissioner's revisions to her budget.

Response: Accept.

The Commissioner's budget has its own Welsh Language Commissioner Budget Expenditure Line (BEL) within the overall Welsh Language Action which makes the annual allocation clear.

The Minister with responsibility for the Welsh Language meets with the Welsh Language Commissioner quarterly, and officials meet on a regular basis. Budgetary matters are discussed in those meetings.

Paragraph 17 of Schedule 1 to the Welsh Language (Wales) Measure 2011 places a duty on the Commissioner to prepare an estimate of the income and expenses of the Commissioner's office and to submit the estimate to the Welsh Ministers at least five months before the beginning of the financial year to which it relates. The Welsh Ministers must examine an estimate submitted to them and must then lay the estimate before the National Assembly for Wales with the modifications (if any) they think appropriate. Usually, the estimate is presented to Ministers in October and Ministers consider the estimate before deciding what the Commissioner's budget allocation should be. As well as that document, Ministers consider the discussions that have been held with the Commissioner during the year. After the Assembly has approved the budget, the Minister writes to the Commissioner to confirm the budget for the following financial year.

As a new Commissioner will start on 1 April 2019, the Minister will meet with the incoming Commissioner early in 2019 to discuss the 2019-20 budget and spending priorities.

Recommendation 9 (paragraph 40)

(i) The Committee would like a much firmer commitment from the Welsh Government as to when a Welsh Language Bill will be introduced.

Response: Reject.

The then First Minister confirmed in his statement on the Legislative Programme on 17 July 2018 that the Welsh Language Bill would not be introduced in year 3 of this Assembly (September 2018 – July 2019).

The schedule for this Bill and other bills in the Legislative Programme is a matter for the First Minister's consideration, based on Cabinet priorities and other pressures such as legislation that has become necessary due to Brexit. Year 4 bills will be published in the next statement on the Legislative Programme before the end of the summer term, as usual. In light of these factors, it is not possible to give a firmer commitment in relation to the timetable of the Bill.

(ii) It is also important that commercial organisations, such as public utilities do not use the lack of Welsh language standards, as an excuse to diminish or stall their Welsh language provision.

The Welsh Government needs to ensure the private sector continues to invest in Welsh language provision. In this context, consideration should be given to providing greater information on the likely provisions of the new legislation to allow private sector organisations to prepare.

Response: Accept.

The Welsh Government consulted on proposals for the private sector in the consultation on our White Paper. The Welsh Government agrees that the private sector should continue to invest in Welsh language provision. We are working on specific projects to this end.

Network of officials to promote the Welsh language in the private sector

A project to increase the use of the Welsh language in business, managed by the Welsh Government through the Mentrau Iaith co-ordinator and a network of 11 business officials. This work began in November 2017. The work includes:

- practical support and advice to enable the private sector to increase the use of the Welsh language, orally, on social media and visually (signs etc).
- projects including training, events and awards.
- holding or co-operating on relevant campaigns by the Welsh Government and others.
- establishing and attending local strategy forums to include key partners.
- co-operating with the Welsh language centers to enhance community language effects.
- monitoring through the pilot 'before and after' data base created with the Welsh Government (that could be a pilot to measure the effect of other language interventions if successful).

Language 'Contact Point'

In a Ministerial Statement in April 2017, Alun Davies promised to establish a 'Welsh language contact point' to assist the private and voluntary sectors to increase their use of the Welsh language. The service will offer free translations for up to 50 words, and includes the Welsh Language Commissioner's proofreading service. It will also respond to various enquiries regarding the Welsh language, and refer people to relevant sources of support.

This is a significant project managed by the Welsh Language Division, with the support of the Welsh Government's Business Wales Department. It will be possible to get in touch by phone, e-mail, text message, webchat, and eventually through a bilingual bot-chat using artificial intelligence.

The contact point will be a center point between the Government, the network of business officials, Business Wales, the Welsh Language Commissioner and the private sector. It will use Business Wales' 'call centre' computer system. It will be launched in the spring of 2019.

Both these projects will be financed through the Welsh Language BEL.

The Minister for Welsh Language and Lifelong Learning announced on 5 June 2018 that there was a delay in preparing regulations regarding the standards as work continues to develop the Welsh Language Bill. Officials will be holding extensive discussions with the private sector as standards affecting them are prepared, ensuring a preparation period is provided before they have to comply with the standards. All standards need to be reasonable and proportionate for all bodies to comply with them.

Recommendation 10 (paragraph 41)

The Committee will wish to return to this investment to seek to establish the outcomes of the spending during the next budget round.

Response: Accept.

We accept the Committee's proposal to return to this investment to seek to establish the outcomes of the spending during the next budget round, as we will be expecting post-completion information following delivery of the project.

Building on the Budget agreement with Plaid Cymru, the £2.75m investment against the £5.5m project will see an improvement in facilities at both Glan-Ilyn and Llangrannog. Specifically, adaptation and extension of the Glan-Ilyn Isaf Educational Centre to provide specialist facilities and accommodation for groups looking for a 'more independent' experience, separate from the main camp; renovation and upgrade of the Glan-Ilyn Water Activities Training Centre to provide water-activity training facilities; and transformation of the 'Heart of the Centre', Llangrannog to improve the usability and flexibility of the camp and to attract new visitors.

These improvements will enhance the current capacity of both camps to meet increasing demand for Welsh-medium experiences in second-language schools; improve buildings in poor condition; meet the demands of visiting school and educational groups; and ensure the camps' educational setting is consistent with the Welsh-medium teaching and learning continuum linked to the emerging Curriculum for Wales.

Eluned Morgan AM

Minister for International Relations and the Welsh Language

Dafydd Elis-Thomas AM

Deputy Minister for Culture, Sport Tourism